

# Omission of Intervals and real $\gamma$ -sets

Boaz Tsaban (AKA Tasban)

**Bar-Ilan University**

Frontiers '17

# 1. Fréchet–Urysohn real function spaces

Fréchet–Urysohn (FU):  $x \in \bar{A} \implies A \ni a_n \longrightarrow x$ .

Metric (or first countable)  $\implies$  FU.

$X \subseteq \mathbb{R}$ ;  $C(X) = \{ \text{cont. } f: X \rightarrow \mathbb{R} \}$ , pointwise convergence top.

$f_n \longrightarrow f \iff f_n(x) \longrightarrow f(x) \quad (\forall x)$ .

$C(X) \subseteq \mathbb{R}^X$ , Tychonoff product.

$C(X)$  is metrizable  $\iff X$  is countable.

Gerlits–Nagy '82, following Arhangel'skii: Could  $C(X)$  be FU?

## 2. $\gamma$ -sets

$X \subseteq \mathbb{R}$ .

**Cover:** Proper ( $X \notin$  the cover) **open cover** of  $X$ .

$\uparrow$

**$\omega$ -cover:**  $\forall$  **finite**  $F \subseteq X$ ,  $\exists$  in the cover  $U \supseteq F$ .

$\uparrow$

**Point-cofinite cover:** Every point is covered by **almost all** sets.

$X$  is a  **$\gamma$ -set**: Every  **$\omega$ -cover** contains a **point-cofinite cover**.

**Gerlits–Nagy '82:**  $C(X)$  is FU  $\iff X$  is a  **$\gamma$ -set**.

### 3. Must there be real $\gamma$ -sets?

Strong measure zero (Borel):  $\forall \epsilon_1, \epsilon_2, \dots, \exists$  a cover by intervals with  $\text{diam}(I_1) < \epsilon_1, \text{diam}(I_2) < \epsilon_2, \dots$

Strong measure zero  $\implies$  measure zero.

Gerlits–Nagy '82:  $\gamma$ -set  $\left(\frac{\Omega}{\Gamma}\right) \implies$  strong measure zero.

### 3. Must there be real $\gamma$ -sets?

Strong measure zero (Borel):  $\forall \epsilon_1, \epsilon_2, \dots, \exists$  a cover by intervals with  $\text{diam}(I_1) < \epsilon_1, \text{diam}(I_2) < \epsilon_2, \dots$

Strong measure zero  $\implies$  measure zero.

Gerlits–Nagy '82:  $\gamma$ -set  $(\frac{\Omega}{\Gamma}) \implies$  strong measure zero.

Laver '76: Consistently, strong measure zero  $\implies$  countable.

(Borel's Conjecture)

•• Consistently,  $C(X)$  is FU only for countable  $X$ .

## 4. The pseudointersection number

$[\mathbb{N}]^\infty$  : The **infinite** subsets of  $\mathbb{N}$ .

$Y \subseteq [\mathbb{N}]^\infty$  is **centered**: Finite intersections of elements are infinite.

## 4. The pseudointersection number

$[\mathbb{N}]^\infty$  : The **infinite** subsets of  $\mathbb{N}$ .

$Y \subseteq [\mathbb{N}]^\infty$  is **centered**: Finite intersections of elements are infinite.

$a \subseteq^* b$ :  $\exists n, a \setminus \{1, \dots, n\} \subseteq b$ .

$$a \setminus \{1, \dots, n\} \subseteq b \setminus \{1, \dots, n\}.$$

**Pseudointersection** of  $Y$ :  $a \in [\mathbb{N}]^\infty, a \subseteq^* y \quad (\forall y \in Y)$ .

## 4. The pseudointersection number

$[\mathbb{N}]^\infty$  : The infinite subsets of  $\mathbb{N}$ .

$Y \subseteq [\mathbb{N}]^\infty$  is centered: Finite intersections of elements are infinite.

$a \subseteq^* b$ :  $\exists n, a \setminus \{1, \dots, n\} \subseteq b$ .

$$a \setminus \{1, \dots, n\} \subseteq b \setminus \{1, \dots, n\}.$$

Pseudointersection of  $Y$ :  $a \in [\mathbb{N}]^\infty, a \subseteq^* y \quad (\forall y \in Y)$ .

$\mathfrak{p}$ : Min. cardinality of a centered family with no pseudointersection.

$\aleph_1 \leq \mathfrak{p} \leq \mathfrak{c} := |\mathbb{R}|$ .

Consistently,  $\aleph_1 < \mathfrak{p}$ .



## 5. Uncountable $\gamma$ -sets

$\mathfrak{p}$ : Min. cardinality of a **centered** family with **no pseudointersection**.

## 5. Uncountable $\gamma$ -sets

$\mathfrak{p}$ : Min. cardinality of a **centered** family with **no pseudointersection**.

$X \subseteq \mathbb{R} \implies$  can restrict to countable covers  $\{U_n\}$ .

$$X \longrightarrow \mathcal{P}(\mathbb{N})$$

$$x \longmapsto \{n : x \in U_n\}$$

$\{U_n\}$   **$\omega$ -cover**  $\implies$  the image of  $X \subseteq [\mathbb{N}]^\infty$ .

## 5. Uncountable $\gamma$ -sets

$\mathfrak{p}$ : Min. cardinality of a **centered** family with **no pseudointersection**.

$X \subseteq \mathbb{R} \implies$  can restrict to countable covers  $\{U_n\}$ .

$$X \longrightarrow P(\mathbb{N})$$

$$x \longmapsto \{n : x \in U_n\}$$

$\{U_n\}$   **$\omega$ -cover**  $\implies$  the image of  $X \subseteq [\mathbb{N}]^\infty$ .

$\{U_n\}$	The image of $X$ in $[\mathbb{N}]^\infty$
<b><math>\omega</math>-cover</b>	<b>centered</b>
has a <b>point-cofinite subcover</b>	has a <b>pseudointersection</b>

## 5. Uncountable $\gamma$ -sets

$\mathfrak{p}$ : Min. cardinality of a **centered** family with **no pseudointersection**.

$X \subseteq \mathbb{R} \implies$  can restrict to countable covers  $\{U_n\}$ .

$$X \longrightarrow P(\mathbb{N})$$

$$x \longmapsto \{n : x \in U_n\}$$

$\{U_n\}$   **$\omega$ -cover**  $\implies$  the image of  $X \subseteq [\mathbb{N}]^\infty$ .

$\{U_n\}$	The image of $X$ in $[\mathbb{N}]^\infty$
<b><math>\omega</math>-cover</b>	<b>centered</b>
has a <b>point-cofinite subcover</b>	has a <b>pseudointersection</b>

- $\bullet\bullet$   $|X| < \mathfrak{p} \implies X$  is a  **$\gamma$ -set**.
- $\bullet\bullet$  Consistently,  $\aleph_1 < \mathfrak{p}$ , and thus  $\exists$  **uncountable  $\gamma$ -sets**.

## 5. Uncountable $\gamma$ -sets

$\mathfrak{p}$ : Min. cardinality of a **centered** family with **no pseudointersection**.

$X \subseteq \mathbb{R} \implies$  can restrict to countable covers  $\{U_n\}$ .

$$X \longrightarrow P(\mathbb{N})$$

$$x \longmapsto \{n : x \in U_n\}$$

$\{U_n\}$   **$\omega$ -cover**  $\implies$  the image of  $X \subseteq [\mathbb{N}]^\infty$ .

$\{U_n\}$	The image of $X$ in $[\mathbb{N}]^\infty$
<b><math>\omega</math>-cover</b>	<b>centered</b>
has a <b>point-cofinite subcover</b>	has a <b>pseudointersection</b>

- $\bullet\bullet$   $|X| < \mathfrak{p} \implies X$  is a  **$\gamma$ -set**.
- $\bullet\bullet$  Consistently,  $\aleph_1 < \mathfrak{p}$ , and thus  $\exists$  **uncountable  $\gamma$ -sets**. **Trivials**.

## 6. Nontrivial $\gamma$ -sets (the early days)

Galvin–Miller (Taylor) '84:  $\mathfrak{p} = \mathfrak{c} \implies$  nontrivial  $\gamma$ -set.

Fin: The finite subsets of  $\mathbb{N}$ .

Construction in  $[\mathbb{N}]^\infty \cup \text{Fin} = \mathbf{P}(\mathbb{N}) = \{0, 1\}^{\mathbb{N}} \subseteq \mathbb{R}$ .

## 6. Nontrivial $\gamma$ -sets (the early days)

Galvin–Miller (Taylor) '84:  $\mathfrak{p} = \mathfrak{c} \implies$  nontrivial  $\gamma$ -set.

Fin: The finite subsets of  $\mathbb{N}$ .

Construction in  $[\mathbb{N}]^\infty \cup \text{Fin} = \mathbf{P}(\mathbb{N}) = \{0, 1\}^\mathbb{N} \subseteq \mathbb{R}$ .

$[\mathbb{N}]^\infty \subseteq \mathbb{N}^\mathbb{N}$  via increasing enumerations:  $a = \{a(1), a(2), \dots\}$ .

For  $a, b \in [\mathbb{N}]^\infty$ ,  $a \leq^* b$ :  $a(n) \leq b(n)$  for almost all  $n$ .

Unbounded in  $[\mathbb{N}]^\infty$ :  $\leq^*$ -unbounded.

## 6. Nontrivial $\gamma$ -sets (the early days)

Galvin–Miller (Taylor) '84:  $\mathfrak{p} = \mathfrak{c} \implies$  nontrivial  $\gamma$ -set.

Fin: The finite subsets of  $\mathbb{N}$ .

Construction in  $[\mathbb{N}]^\infty \cup \text{Fin} = \mathbf{P}(\mathbb{N}) = \{0, 1\}^{\mathbb{N}} \subseteq \mathbb{R}$ .

$[\mathbb{N}]^\infty \subseteq \mathbb{N}^{\mathbb{N}}$  via increasing enumerations:  $a = \{a(1), a(2), \dots\}$ .

For  $a, b \in [\mathbb{N}]^\infty$ ,  $a \leq^* b$ :  $a(n) \leq b(n)$  for almost all  $n$ .

Unbounded in  $[\mathbb{N}]^\infty$ :  $\leq^*$ -unbounded.

Unbounded  $\kappa$ -tower:

Unbounded  $\{x_\alpha : \alpha < \kappa\} \subseteq [\mathbb{N}]^\infty$ ,  $x_\alpha \not\leq^* x_\beta$  ( $\forall \alpha < \beta$ ).



## 6. Nontrivial $\gamma$ -sets (the early days)

Galvin–Miller (Taylor) '84:  $\mathfrak{p} = \mathfrak{c} \implies$  nontrivial  $\gamma$ -set.

Fin: The finite subsets of  $\mathbb{N}$ .

Construction in  $[\mathbb{N}]^\infty \cup \text{Fin} = \mathbf{P}(\mathbb{N}) = \{0, 1\}^{\mathbb{N}} \subseteq \mathbb{R}$ .

$[\mathbb{N}]^\infty \subseteq \mathbb{N}^{\mathbb{N}}$  via increasing enumerations:  $a = \{a(1), a(2), \dots\}$ .

For  $a, b \in [\mathbb{N}]^\infty$ ,  $a \leq^* b$ :  $a(n) \leq b(n)$  for almost all  $n$ .

Unbounded in  $[\mathbb{N}]^\infty$ :  $\leq^*$ -unbounded.

Unbounded  $\kappa$ -tower:

Unbounded  $\{x_\alpha : \alpha < \kappa\} \subseteq [\mathbb{N}]^\infty$ ,  $x_\alpha \not\leq^* x_\beta$  ( $\forall \alpha < \beta$ ).

GM '84:  $\mathfrak{p} = \mathfrak{c} \implies \exists$  unb.  $\mathfrak{p}$ -tower  $T$ ,  $T \cup \text{Fin}$  a  $\gamma$ -set.

Proof considers all potential  $\omega$ -covers (thus  $\mathfrak{p} = \mathfrak{c}$ ).

## 7. The $\gamma$ -Set Problem

JMSS '96, Miller '05, Gruenhage–Szeptycki '05, . . . :

$T$  unbounded  $\mathfrak{p}$ -tower  $\implies T \cup \text{Fin}$  is a  $\gamma$ -set? What if  $\mathfrak{p} = \aleph_1$ ?

## 7. The $\gamma$ -Set Problem

JMSS '96, Miller '05, Gruenhage–Szeptycki '05, . . . :

$T$  unbounded  $\mathfrak{p}$ -tower  $\implies T \cup \text{Fin}$  is a  $\gamma$ -set? What if  $\mathfrak{p} = \aleph_1$ ?

$\mathfrak{b}$ : Minimal cardinality of an unbounded ( $\leq^*$ ) set in  $[\mathbb{N}]^\infty$ .

$\mathfrak{p} \leq \mathfrak{b}$ , and  $\mathfrak{p} < \mathfrak{b}$  is consistent.

$\exists$  unbounded  $\mathfrak{p}$ -tower  $\iff \mathfrak{p} = \mathfrak{b}$ .

## 7. The $\gamma$ -Set Problem

JMSS '96, Miller '05, Gruenhage–Szeptycki '05, . . . :

$T$  unbounded  $\mathfrak{p}$ -tower  $\implies T \cup \text{Fin}$  is a  $\gamma$ -set? What if  $\mathfrak{p} = \aleph_1$ ?

$\mathfrak{b}$ : Minimal cardinality of an unbounded ( $\leq^*$ ) set in  $[\mathbb{N}]^\infty$ .

$\mathfrak{p} \leq \mathfrak{b}$ , and  $\mathfrak{p} < \mathfrak{b}$  is consistent.

$\exists$  unbounded  $\mathfrak{p}$ -tower  $\iff \mathfrak{p} = \mathfrak{b}$ .

Partial answers:

$\mathfrak{p} = \aleph_1 \implies U_{\text{fin}}(\mathcal{O}, \Gamma)$  (Just–Miller–Scheepers–Szeptycki '96),

even  $S_1(\Gamma, \Gamma)$  (Scheepers '98).

Solved Hurewicz's 1925 problem!

## 7. The $\gamma$ -Set Problem

JMSS '96, Miller '05, Gruenhage–Szeptycki '05, . . . :

$T$  unbounded  $\mathfrak{p}$ -tower  $\implies T \cup \text{Fin}$  is a  $\gamma$ -set? What if  $\mathfrak{p} = \aleph_1$ ?

$\mathfrak{b}$ : Minimal cardinality of an unbounded ( $\leq^*$ ) set in  $[\mathbb{N}]^\infty$ .

$\mathfrak{p} \leq \mathfrak{b}$ , and  $\mathfrak{p} < \mathfrak{b}$  is consistent.

$\exists$  unbounded  $\mathfrak{p}$ -tower  $\iff \mathfrak{p} = \mathfrak{b}$ .

Partial answers:

$\mathfrak{p} = \aleph_1 \implies U_{\text{fin}}(\mathcal{O}, \Gamma)$  (Just–Miller–Scheepers–Szeptycki '96),  
even  $S_1(\Gamma, \Gamma)$  (Scheepers '98).

Solved Hurewicz's 1925 problem!

**Existence**, assuming Dzamonja–Hrusak–Moore  $\diamond(\mathfrak{b})$  (Miller '05) .

**Weak  $\gamma$ -set** (Gruenhage–Szeptycki '05).

## 8. The $\gamma$ -Set Theorem

Ts '11

$T$  unbounded  $p$ -tower  $\implies T \cup \text{Fin}$  is a  $\gamma$ -set.

## 8. The $\gamma$ -Set Theorem

Ts '11

$T$  unbounded  $p$ -tower  $\implies T \cup \text{Fin}$  is a  $\gamma$ -set.

Uses **F. Jordan Fusion** + **insanely intricate diagonalizations**.

Proof not conceptual. **No one understands it.** :(

**Goal:** A proof I can explain.

## 9. Omission of intervals

Metric on  $P(\mathbb{N})$ :  $\text{dist}(a, b) := \frac{1}{\min a \Delta b}$ .

$\text{dist}(a, b) < \frac{1}{k} \iff a \cap \{1, \dots, k\} = b \cap \{1, \dots, k\}$ .



## 9. Omission of intervals

Metric on  $P(\mathbb{N})$ :  $\text{dist}(a, b) := \frac{1}{\min a \Delta b}$ .

$\text{dist}(a, b) < \frac{1}{k} \iff a \cap \{1, \dots, k\} = b \cap \{1, \dots, k\}$ .

$P(\{1, \dots, n\}) \subseteq U$  open  $\implies \exists k > n$ ,  $\underbrace{\bigcup_{a \in P(\{1, \dots, n\})} B(a, \frac{1}{k})}_{\{x \in P(\mathbb{N}) : x \cap (n, k] = \emptyset\}} \subseteq U$ .

## 9. Omission of intervals

Metric on  $P(\mathbb{N})$ :  $\text{dist}(a, b) := \frac{1}{\min a \Delta b}$ .

$\text{dist}(a, b) < \frac{1}{k} \iff a \cap \{1, \dots, k\} = b \cap \{1, \dots, k\}$ .

$P(\{1, \dots, n\}) \subseteq U$  open  $\implies \exists k > n$ ,  $\bigcup_{\substack{a \in P(\{1, \dots, n\}) \\ \{x \in P(\mathbb{N}) : x \cap (n, k] = \emptyset\}}} B(a, \frac{1}{k}) \subseteq U$ .

Assume  $\mathcal{U}$   $\omega$ -covers Fin.

$\forall n \exists U \in \mathcal{U}, k > n: x \cap (n, k) = \emptyset \implies x \in U$ .

### Galvin–Miller Lemma

Let  $\mathcal{U}$   $\omega$ -cover Fin. Then  $\exists a \in [\mathbb{N}]^\infty, U_1, U_2, \dots \in \mathcal{U}$ :

$$x \cap (a(n), a(n+1)) = \emptyset \implies x \in U_n \quad (\forall x)$$

## 10. Getting $S_1(\Gamma, \Gamma)$ , via OMI

Scheepers '98, improving JMSS '96:

$T$  unbounded  $\mathfrak{b}$ -tower  $\implies T \cup \text{Fin } S_1(\Gamma, \Gamma)$ .

Proof:

## 10. Getting $S_1(\Gamma, \Gamma)$ , via OMI

Scheepers '98, improving JMSS '96:

$T$  unbounded  $\mathfrak{b}$ -tower  $\implies T \cup \text{Fin } S_1(\Gamma, \Gamma)$ .

Proof:

$X = \text{Fin} \cup \{x_\alpha : \alpha < \mathfrak{b}\}$ .

## 10. Getting $S_1(\Gamma, \Gamma)$ , via OMI

Scheepers '98, improving JMSS '96:

$T$  unbounded  $\mathfrak{b}$ -tower  $\implies T \cup \text{Fin } S_1(\Gamma, \Gamma)$ .

Proof:

$X = \text{Fin} \cup \{x_\alpha : \alpha < \mathfrak{b}\}$ .

$\mathcal{U}_1, \mathcal{U}_2, \dots \in \Gamma(X)$ .

## 10. Getting $S_1(\Gamma, \Gamma)$ , via OMI

Scheepers '98, improving JMSS '96:

$T$  unbounded  $\mathfrak{b}$ -tower  $\implies T \cup \text{Fin } S_1(\Gamma, \Gamma)$ .

Proof:

$X = \text{Fin} \cup \{x_\alpha : \alpha < \mathfrak{b}\}$ .

$\mathcal{U}_1, \mathcal{U}_2, \dots \in \Gamma(X)$ .

GM sequences  $a_1, a_2, \dots$  (Thin out covers.)

## 10. Getting $S_1(\Gamma, \Gamma)$ , via OMI

Scheepers '98, improving JMSS '96:

$T$  unbounded  $\mathfrak{b}$ -tower  $\implies T \cup \text{Fin } S_1(\Gamma, \Gamma)$ .

Proof:

$X = \text{Fin} \cup \{x_\alpha : \alpha < \mathfrak{b}\}$ .

$\mathcal{U}_1, \mathcal{U}_2, \dots \in \Gamma(X)$ .

GM sequences  $a_1, a_2, \dots$  (Thin out covers.)

$a_1, a_2, \dots \leq^\infty x_\gamma$ .

## 10. Getting $S_1(\Gamma, \Gamma)$ , via OMI

Scheepers '98, improving JMSS '96:

$T$  unbounded  $\mathfrak{b}$ -tower  $\implies T \cup \text{Fin } S_1(\Gamma, \Gamma)$ .

Proof:

$X = \text{Fin} \cup \{x_\alpha : \alpha < \mathfrak{b}\}$ .

$\mathcal{U}_1, \mathcal{U}_2, \dots \in \Gamma(X)$ .

GM sequences  $a_1, a_2, \dots$ . (Thin out covers.)

$a_1, a_2, \dots \leq^\infty x_\gamma$ . Thin out covers for  $x_\gamma \in \text{all}$ .



## 10. Getting $S_1(\Gamma, \Gamma)$ , via OMI

Scheepers '98, improving JMSS '96:

$T$  unbounded  $\mathfrak{b}$ -tower  $\implies T \cup \text{Fin } S_1(\Gamma, \Gamma)$ .

Proof:

$X = \text{Fin} \cup \{x_\alpha : \alpha < \mathfrak{b}\}$ .

$\mathcal{U}_1, \mathcal{U}_2, \dots \in \Gamma(X)$ .

GM sequences  $a_1, a_2, \dots$ . (Thin out covers.)

$a_1, a_2, \dots \leq^\infty x_\gamma$ . Thin out covers for  $x_\gamma \in \text{all}$ .

$\alpha \geq \gamma$ :  $x_\gamma \supseteq^* x_\alpha$ . Remove first  $n$  elements from  $\mathcal{U}_n \implies$

$x_\gamma \in^* U_{m_n}^n$  for each selection.

## 10. Getting $S_1(\Gamma, \Gamma)$ , via OMI

Scheepers '98, improving JMSS '96:

$T$  unbounded  $\mathfrak{b}$ -tower  $\implies T \cup \text{Fin } S_1(\Gamma, \Gamma)$ .

Proof:

$X = \text{Fin} \cup \{x_\alpha : \alpha < \mathfrak{b}\}$ .

$\mathcal{U}_1, \mathcal{U}_2, \dots \in \Gamma(X)$ .

GM sequences  $a_1, a_2, \dots$  (Thin out covers.)

$a_1, a_2, \dots \leq^\infty x_\gamma$ . Thin out covers for  $x_\gamma \in \text{all}$ .

$\alpha \geq \gamma$ :  $x_\gamma \supseteq^* x_\alpha$ . Remove first  $n$  elements from  $\mathcal{U}_n \implies$

$x_\gamma \in^* U_{m_n}^n$  for each selection.

$X_\gamma := \text{Fin} \cup \{x_\alpha : \alpha < \gamma\}$ .

## 10. Getting $S_1(\Gamma, \Gamma)$ , via OMI

Scheepers '98, improving JMSS '96:

$T$  unbounded  $\mathfrak{b}$ -tower  $\implies T \cup \text{Fin } S_1(\Gamma, \Gamma)$ .

Proof:

$X = \text{Fin} \cup \{x_\alpha : \alpha < \mathfrak{b}\}$ .

$\mathcal{U}_1, \mathcal{U}_2, \dots \in \Gamma(X)$ .

GM sequences  $a_1, a_2, \dots$ . (Thin out covers.)

$a_1, a_2, \dots \leq^\infty x_\gamma$ . Thin out covers for  $x_\gamma \in \text{all}$ .

$\alpha \geq \gamma$ :  $x_\gamma \supseteq^* x_\alpha$ . Remove first  $n$  elements from  $\mathcal{U}_n \implies$

$x_\gamma \in^* U_{m_n}^n$  for each selection.

$X_\gamma := \text{Fin} \cup \{x_\alpha : \alpha < \gamma\}$ .  $< \mathfrak{b} \implies \exists \{U_{m_n}^n : n \in \mathbb{N}\} \in \Gamma(X_\gamma)$ .

## 11. Key Lemma

$Y \subseteq [\mathbb{N}]^\infty$  unbounded,  $a \in [\mathbb{N}]^\infty$

$\implies$  some  $b \in Y$  omits infinitely many intervals  $(a(n), a(n+1))$ .

## 11. Key Lemma

$Y \subseteq [\mathbb{N}]^\infty$  **unbounded**,  $a \in [\mathbb{N}]^\infty$

$\implies$  some  $b \in Y$  omits **infinitely many** intervals  $(a(n), a(n+1))$ .

Key Lemma (Ts '16, following Galvin–Miller)

Let  $\mathcal{U}$   $\omega$ -cover  $\text{Fin} \subseteq X$ ,  $|X| < \mathfrak{p}$ , and  $Y \subseteq [\mathbb{N}]^\infty$  **unbounded**.

$\exists a \in Y$ ,  $U_1, U_2, \dots \in \mathcal{U}$  a **point-cofinite** cover of  $X$ :

$$b \setminus \{1, \dots, n\} \subseteq a \implies b \in U_n, U_{n+1}, \dots \quad (\forall n).$$

## 11. Key Lemma

$Y \subseteq [\mathbb{N}]^\infty$  **unbounded**,  $a \in [\mathbb{N}]^\infty$

$\implies$  some  $b \in Y$  omits **infinitely many** intervals  $(a(n), a(n+1))$ .

Key Lemma (Ts '16, following Galvin–Miller)

Let  $\mathcal{U}$   $\omega$ -cover  $\text{Fin} \subseteq X$ ,  $|X| < \mathfrak{p}$ , and  $Y \subseteq [\mathbb{N}]^\infty$  **unbounded**.

$\exists a \in Y$ ,  $U_1, U_2, \dots \in \mathcal{U}$  a **point-cofinite** cover of  $X$ :

$$b \setminus \{1, \dots, n\} \subseteq a \implies b \in U_n, U_{n+1}, \dots \quad (\forall n).$$

Proof: Thin  $\mathcal{U}$  to a point-cofinite cover of  $X$ ; GM Lemma (thin #2); Take the  $U_n$ 's with omitted intervals (thin #3).  
 $n < n$ -th omitted interval.

## 12. Applying the Key Lemma $\aleph_0$ times

$\mathfrak{p} = \mathfrak{b}$ .  $X = \text{Fin} \cup \{x_\alpha : \alpha < \mathfrak{b}\}$ .

$X_\gamma := \text{Fin} \cup \{x_\alpha : \alpha < \gamma\}$ .

$X_{\gamma_0}$  arbitrary. By Key Lemma,  $\exists$ :

$U_1^{(1)}, U_2^{(1)}, \dots \in \mathcal{U}$  a point-cofinite cover of  $X_{\gamma_0}$ ,

$$b \setminus \{1, \dots, n\} \subseteq x_{\gamma_1} \implies b \in U_n^{(1)}, U_{n+1}^{(1)}, \dots$$

## 12. Applying the Key Lemma $\aleph_0$ times

$\mathfrak{p} = \mathfrak{b}$ .  $X = \text{Fin} \cup \{x_\alpha : \alpha < \mathfrak{b}\}$ .

$X_\gamma := \text{Fin} \cup \{x_\alpha : \alpha < \gamma\}$ .

$X_{\gamma_0}$  arbitrary. By Key Lemma,  $\exists$ :

$U_1^{(1)}, U_2^{(1)}, \dots \in \mathcal{U}$  a point-cofinite cover of  $X_{\gamma_0}$ ,

$$b \setminus \{1, \dots, n\} \subseteq x_{\gamma_1} \implies b \in U_n^{(1)}, U_{n+1}^{(1)}, \dots$$

$U_1^{(2)}, U_2^{(2)}, \dots \in \mathcal{U}$  a point-cofinite cover of  $X_{\gamma_1}, x_{\gamma_2}$ ,

$$b \setminus \{1, \dots, n\} \subseteq x_{\gamma_2} \implies b \in U_n^{(2)}, U_{n+1}^{(2)}, \dots$$

Etc . . . .



## 12. Applying the Key Lemma $\aleph_0$ times

$\mathfrak{p} = \mathfrak{b}$ .  $X = \text{Fin} \cup \{x_\alpha : \alpha < \mathfrak{b}\}$ .

$X_\gamma := \text{Fin} \cup \{x_\alpha : \alpha < \gamma\}$ .

$X_{\gamma_0}$  arbitrary. By Key Lemma,  $\exists$ :

$U_1^{(1)}, U_2^{(1)}, \dots \in \mathcal{U}$  a point-cofinite cover of  $X_{\gamma_0}$ ,

$$b \setminus \{1, \dots, n\} \subseteq x_{\gamma_1} \implies b \in U_n^{(1)}, U_{n+1}^{(1)}, \dots$$

$U_1^{(2)}, U_2^{(2)}, \dots \in \mathcal{U}$  a point-cofinite cover of  $X_{\gamma_1}, x_{\gamma_2}$ ,

$$b \setminus \{1, \dots, n\} \subseteq x_{\gamma_2} \implies b \in U_n^{(2)}, U_{n+1}^{(2)}, \dots$$

Etc ... .  $\gamma := \sup_n \gamma_n < \mathfrak{b}$ .  $x_\gamma \setminus \{1, \dots, g(n)\} \subseteq x_{\gamma_n}$ .

## 12. Applying the Key Lemma $\aleph_0$ times

$\mathfrak{p} = \mathfrak{b}$ .  $X = \text{Fin} \cup \{x_\alpha : \alpha < \mathfrak{b}\}$ .

$X_\gamma := \text{Fin} \cup \{x_\alpha : \alpha < \gamma\}$ .

$X_{\gamma_0}$  arbitrary. By Key Lemma,  $\exists$ :

$U_1^{(1)}, U_2^{(1)}, \dots \in \mathcal{U}$  a point-cofinite cover of  $X_{\gamma_0}$ ,

$$b \setminus \{1, \dots, n\} \subseteq x_{\gamma_1} \implies b \in U_n^{(1)}, U_{n+1}^{(1)}, \dots$$

$U_1^{(2)}, U_2^{(2)}, \dots \in \mathcal{U}$  a point-cofinite cover of  $X_{\gamma_1}, x_{\gamma_2}$ ,

$$b \setminus \{1, \dots, n\} \subseteq x_{\gamma_2} \implies b \in U_n^{(2)}, U_{n+1}^{(2)}, \dots$$

Etc ... .  $\gamma := \sup_n \gamma_n < \mathfrak{b}$ .  $x_\gamma \setminus \{1, \dots, g(n)\} \subseteq x_{\gamma_n}$ .

$\alpha \geq \gamma \implies x_\alpha \subseteq^* x_\gamma \implies \forall^* n : x_\alpha \setminus \{1, \dots, g(n)\} \subseteq x_{\gamma_n} \implies$

$x_\alpha \in U_{g(n)}^{(n)}, U_{g(n)+1}^{(n)}, \dots$

## 12. Applying the Key Lemma $\aleph_0$ times

$\mathfrak{p} = \mathfrak{b}$ .  $X = \text{Fin} \cup \{x_\alpha : \alpha < \mathfrak{b}\}$ .

$X_\gamma := \text{Fin} \cup \{x_\alpha : \alpha < \gamma\}$ .

$X_{\gamma_0}$  arbitrary. By Key Lemma,  $\exists$ :

$U_1^{(1)}, U_2^{(1)}, \dots \in \mathcal{U}$  a point-cofinite cover of  $X_{\gamma_0}$ ,

$$b \setminus \{1, \dots, n\} \subseteq x_{\gamma_1} \implies b \in U_n^{(1)}, U_{n+1}^{(1)}, \dots$$

$U_1^{(2)}, U_2^{(2)}, \dots \in \mathcal{U}$  a point-cofinite cover of  $X_{\gamma_1}, x_{\gamma_2}$ ,

$$b \setminus \{1, \dots, n\} \subseteq x_{\gamma_2} \implies b \in U_n^{(2)}, U_{n+1}^{(2)}, \dots$$

Etc ... .  $\gamma := \sup_n \gamma_n < \mathfrak{b}$ .  $x_\gamma \setminus \{1, \dots, g(n)\} \subseteq x_{\gamma_n}$ .

$\alpha \geq \gamma \implies x_\alpha \subseteq^* x_\gamma \implies \forall^* n : x_\alpha \setminus \{1, \dots, g(n)\} \subseteq x_{\gamma_n} \implies$

$x_\alpha \in U_{g(n)}^{(n)}, U_{g(n)+1}^{(n)}, \dots$ . Remove the first  $g(n)$  open sets.

## 12. Applying the Key Lemma $\aleph_0$ times

$\mathfrak{p} = \mathfrak{b}$ .  $X = \text{Fin} \cup \{x_\alpha : \alpha < \mathfrak{b}\}$ .

$X_\gamma := \text{Fin} \cup \{x_\alpha : \alpha < \gamma\}$ .

$X_{\gamma_0}$  arbitrary. By Key Lemma,  $\exists$ :

$U_1^{(1)}, U_2^{(1)}, \dots \in \mathcal{U}$  a point-cofinite cover of  $X_{\gamma_0}$ ,

$$b \setminus \{1, \dots, n\} \subseteq x_{\gamma_1} \implies b \in U_n^{(1)}, U_{n+1}^{(1)}, \dots$$

$U_1^{(2)}, U_2^{(2)}, \dots \in \mathcal{U}$  a point-cofinite cover of  $X_{\gamma_1}, x_{\gamma_2}$ ,

$$b \setminus \{1, \dots, n\} \subseteq x_{\gamma_2} \implies b \in U_n^{(2)}, U_{n+1}^{(2)}, \dots$$

Etc ... .  $\gamma := \sup_n \gamma_n < \mathfrak{b}$ .  $x_\gamma \setminus \{1, \dots, g(n)\} \subseteq x_{\gamma_n}$ .

$\alpha \geq \gamma \implies x_\alpha \subseteq^* x_\gamma \implies \forall^* n : x_\alpha \setminus \{1, \dots, g(n)\} \subseteq x_{\gamma_n} \implies$

$x_\alpha \in U_{g(n)}^{(n)}, U_{g(n)+1}^{(n)}, \dots$ . Remove the first  $g(n)$  open sets.

Any selection is a point-cofinite cover of  $\{x_\alpha : \alpha \geq \gamma\}$ !

### 13. Covering $X_\gamma = \bigcup_n X_{\gamma_n}$

$$X_{\gamma_1} \subseteq X_{\gamma_2} \subseteq \cdots \subseteq X_\gamma.$$

### 13. Covering $X_\gamma = \bigcup_n X_{\gamma_n}$

$$X_{\gamma_1} \subseteq X_{\gamma_2} \subseteq \dots \subseteq X_\gamma.$$

$$X_\gamma \longrightarrow \mathbb{N}^{\mathbb{N}}$$

$$x \longmapsto f_x(n) = \min \left\{ k : x \in U_k^{(n)}, U_{k+1}^{(n)}, \dots \right\}$$

$$|X_\gamma| < \mathfrak{b} \implies \{f_x : x \in X_\gamma\} \leq^* h.$$

- $U_{h(n)}^{(n)}$  point-cofinite cover of  $X_\gamma$ , thus of  $X$ .

60. Goal reached! THANK YOU

